EARLY MUSIC SUMMIT

ONLINE

20/22 NOVEMBER 2020

REPORT

EARLY MUSIC CONNECTION

OUR FUTURE PAST

WWW.EARLYMUSIC.EU

ORGANIZED BY

REMA / EARLY MUSIC IN EUROPE | BOZAR

IN PARTNERSHIP WITH

Association Européenne des Conservatoires, Académies de Musique et Musikhochschulen | KUNSTEN PUNT

SUPPORTED BY

Culture communication

Co-funded by the Creative Europe Programme of the European Union

FRIDAY 20 NOVEMBER

SATURDAY 21 NOVEMBER

SUNDAY 22 NOVEMBER

EARLY MUSIC SUMMIT

ONLINE

FRIDAY

20 NOVEMBER

EARLY MUSIC CONTINUUM

WELCOME SPEECH AND OPENING KEYNOTE

LOOKING BACK, FACING AHEAD

BERNARD FOCCROULLE Festival Lyrique d'Aix en Provence, La Monnaie / De Munt
NICOLAS BUCHER Centre de Musique Baroque de Versailles
ALBERT EDELMAN REMA - European Early Music Network
ISAAC ALONSO DE MOLINA Royal Conservatory of The Hague

It's chairman Albert Edelman who addresses the over 400 attendees on the brink of what is to become a lavish celebration in honor of 20 years of REMA. As the network has entered its roaring twenties, a jam-packed, three-day summit will provide ample opportunity to take stock of the past and nose to windward, straight into the future. Many a REMA enthusiast - including students and performers, agents, educators, networkers, researchers, journalists and policy makers - has gathered on Friday morning for a festive overture that is to embody what the network stands for: the passion for historical repertoires and reflection about theory, practice, ethics and aesthetics far beyond the realm of music. The societal role of the early music sector, in particular, will be a talking point throughout the summit. "Culture is special and powerful," Edelman says, "So how can we use this force to make the world a better place?"
Isaac Alonso de Molina - professor at The Hague Conservatory, AEC Early Music Task Force Chairman and representative of AEC in REMA - sets off by framing REMA's efforts within the broader scope of European network organizations that emerged from early music practices. Offering the key to a fruitful summit, Molina adds: "Terms like past, present, future: they're not as simple as they might seem. And sometimes this makes it difficult to understand each other. Let's use these days to present different views and to confront them, to instigate discussion and refine our ideas as a point of departure for the future".
A short introduction by Nicolas Bucher of the Centre de Musique Baroque de Versailles opens the floor to the guest of honor: musician, composer and iconic intendant Bernard Foccroulle.

"I'm happy to find so many of you here, in spite of the current, dramatic crisis. This is a good time to come together and reflect on dangers and opportunities for our sector. I will discuss three threats I consider to be crucial: the global issue of consumerism, increasing standardization, and the relevance of early music in society.
My reflection starts with a notion from Hannah Arendt's book *Between Past and Future:* entertainment destroys culture. I think of her words as a prophecy: entertainment is destructing culture as well as humanity. This is also affecting early music. Who's still able to listen to Vivaldi's *Four Seasons* or Bach's famous *Toccata* with unbiased ears? What's authenticity worth now that it has become a label? Art and entertainment are opposites. Think of what it means to read a

book: bringing something of yourself to the text. Reading a book is writing it. This implies an active attitude, while consuming is passive. We need to focus on art as a creative act.

Let's not get stuck in fake oppositions such as heritage and creation, or useless divisions such as past, present and future. The lines are blurred in so many ways. Look at the pioneer generation of the early music movement: through historical repertoires they were exploring a new world. A world as new as that of contemporary music, in which many of them were involved as well. Today, the two streams flow together in the work of a growing number of composers willing to work with early music instruments. Their practice is the mirror image of the modernity that we find in centuries-old oeuvres like those of Froberger, Couperin, Monteverdi, Gesualdo, Ciconia, Ockeghem and Rameau. Theirs is 'living' music and it is our task to again and again give life to it. At the same time we see early music practices getting adopted by a wider field of performers, and in that way too the realms of early, contemporary and even jazz music are touching.

All this helps to build a wall against dogmas such as 'authentic representation'. A powerful antidote to dogmatic discourses is creating openness and building bridges not only between times and genres but even between artistic disciplines. The worlds of opera and dance have good practices to boast in this respect, think of Trisha Brown, Pina Bausch and Anne Teresa De Keersmaeker. As they know too well, one might be confronted with the occasional failure or scandal, but isn't that inherent to art? Shouldn't we be more open to confrontation in early music? Let's leverage on other strengths as well, such as the digital tools at our disposal. Let's also employ the European identity to counteract consumerism: we have a unique history of diversity rooted in a wide variety of traditions and languages. We should be proud of that and learn from it.

Furthermore, I believe that not only artists but the audience too should be an active participant in the creative process related to early music. A vivid audience is so much more than a mere 'receptor': it can bring energy and beauty to the performance. We can further participation through inclusiveness. Because while baroque programs have permeated the concert hall, the diversity of our audiences still doesn't reflect the diversity seen in our cities. That is an issue, because what can the societal relevance of such music scene be?

This leads into my final topic: cultural rights. Recognized by institutions such as UNESCO, cultural rights are practically terra incognita in the world of arts. At the core is the right to enjoy culture in conditions of equality, human dignity and non-discrimination. Are we paying enough attention to people living in difficult circumstances? How can we reach out? Can we devise projects that reflect the diversity and multicultural identity of the communities in which we live and work? Exemplary projects are showing potential, but it has not yet become a major concern in the sector. I say: we know the theory, let's now practice.

So what is my view on what lies ahead? I first of all hope we prepare for the future in such a way that we avoid getting back to 'business as usual' after the pandemic. Making the same mistakes again would be the biggest mistake of all. We are collectively responsible for the crisis because of the way we were living. Now we also share the detrimental consequences. Let's therefore think about how to induce change. About how to make creative use of digital tools. About sustaining our heritage and transmitting it to future generations. About ways to make mobility more respectful and ecological. And about a new equilibrium between economy and environment.

A suggestion as to the latter could be to consider creating more mid-term residencies, that allow for time to be spent on creating rather than touring. I would also suggest to invite other artists - poets,

painters, ….- into our realm: interdisciplinary work could be a great way to explore avenues for the future of early music. The place of younger generations is also a key point. We cannot have them sacrificed by the globalization, stringent finances and post-covid fallout. Instead, we must work with them towards a new role for the artist in replacement of the 19th-century paradigm. Back then the notion of an artist was that of an isolated person, not understood by society. In the 20th century the isolation led to the emergence of the avantgarde. But in 2020 the image of the lone ranger is long overdue. We should reconsider the artist as someone who - with the biggest freedom imaginable - builds bridges between people. The world is full of hate preachers. Art should be the opposite.

Finally, I think we should invest in networks at all levels - from local and regional to national and international - that operate in a multilateral and horizontal way, based on the notion of sharing without imposition. Just like residencies and long-term collaborations between artists, organizers and educators, professional networks allow artists to meet people outside of their everyday scope. Only by standing on each other's shoulders we can make the cultural revolution a reality."

Sofie Taes

PANEL

WHAT CAN EUROPE DO FOR EARLY MUSIC?

ANITA DEBAERE PEARLE*
BERNARD FOCCROULLE Festival Lyrique d'Aix en Provence, La Monnaie / De Munt
BARBARA GESSLER Creative Europe, European Commission & Directorate General Education and Culture
LIONEL MEUNIER Vox Luminis

The greatest contribution of Europe to Early Music this century is seen as being the mobility that has allowed not just touring and professional travel but the ability of ensembles to form without having to worry about where in Europe the members come from. EM was also seen in the context of European integration and the resultant peace across borders. In most of the periods when the music was produced, Europe was riven by war. This century the most performers have had to put up with (until COVID) have been bureaucratic tax and social security hurdles.

As the idea of mobility began to dominate the conversation the European issue did not fade but came to be understood as behind everybody's thoughts. The question became how European programmes could be adjusted so that they reflect new ideas about travel, audience building, digital working and career development.

OBSERVATIONS

• There are Conservatoire departments that now have no students from the host country.

• It is not unusual for a musician to spend half the time outside the home country.

• Mobility has become a state of mind as well as a physical reality. It is no longer about how many cities can be crammed into a tour. Too often currently success is defined by the extent of travelling.

• Environmental considerations and climate change questions are reshaping attitudes to mobility (touring and professional 'ensemble hopping'). Post COVID travel should be less frenetic. Slow travel, with longer periods of paid accommodation and fewer one night stands, should be encouraged.

• Residencies, whether at festivals or in arts venues, are likely to to become more important.

European projects should be adjusted to put them higher up the agenda.

• Digital connection is a form of mobility but, while artists are helped with digital working, there need to be new ways of financing this side of their work, and European programmes that enable it. At the moment only physical mobility is recognised as 'added value' in most EU schemes. 'Blended mobility' needs to become the norm.

• There needs to be a wider concept of mobility that encompasses social and diversity mobility as well as local mobility – the movement into the concert space of audiences who would not normally step inside. This does not only apply to disadvantaged or minority groups but to those arts audiences that usually only attend events from other age groups, genres and traditions.

• Exclusive contracts, limiting appearances to a small area within a prescribed period, should be phased out and new ways for promoters to collaborate devised so that unnecessary travel is curtailed.

Simon Mundy

PANEL

SUSTAINABLE CAREER DEVELOPMENT

WERNER TRIO VRT
STEF CONINX Kunstenpunt
ROMINA LISCHKA gambist
BARIS TOKER BT ARTS
ELISABETH CHAMPOLLION recorder player

Careers in music outside full time orchestra and opera contracts have never been easy and this year's challenges have demonstrated the fragility of the concert, festival and freelance economy. Sustainability has come to be seen as a difficult issue from many sides. There is a growing awareness that touring that takes advantage of cheap air travel to involve as many hops between airports as possible to make a schedule look impressive is becoming less attractive as well as damaging to many of the life philosophies of early music adherents. This year COVID has made such journeys and the concerts themselves impossible and musicians are having to be inventive in terms of formats and appearances. Sustaining a career from college to retirement, the question of the shelf life of ensembles and performance styles, is no easier than ever.

The introduction video featured **Delma Tomlin** of the National Centre of Early Music York (UK) in conversation with the UK based German recorder player **Tabea Debus**. The main topic revolved around the transition period all young professionals go through after completing their conservatoire training. Debus was asked to reflect on the beginnings of her career and how she managed to successfully build it relatively early on: being a recorder player this meant her main occupation would be in the freelance world. One of the key points in her opinion includes the necessity of networking as well as participation in several young artist schemes in the UK and elsewhere in Europe. They further discussed the benefits competitions might have either for young soloists or ensembles, not just because of the experience of competing but also because it is in itself a suitable platform for networking. Based on their experience, the production value of sent-in audition tapes should be considered a priority with artists enlisting into competitions. Sustainable career planning should ideally begin already in the university: related to the quality of sound recordings one should plan enough in advance to still use the facilities of the university in order to produce some kick-off recordings

without the usual cost of record production. Another point lay in training oneself in the skills of promotion and marketing without the fear of failure, getting to know different types of audiences so that ultimately one becomes more flexible not just in performing but also program planning. Tomlin also stressed the importance of promotion initiative from the side of the performer, remarking that as a promoter or organiser the business nature of the artist they are representing plays a significant role, something which may ultimately make them choose one artist who is well engaged in self-promoting, before one who might be a slightly better player but lacks the above mentioned skills.

Elisabeth Champollion is most currently involved in finding pandemic-compatible concert programmes which aren't primarily conducted online. She developed a format of one-on-one concerts. Similarly to Tabea Debus she too stressed the freelance nature of her job, being a recorder player thus exposing the necessity of an individual and strong approach to networking and self-promoting. Her idea of a well-balanced career consists of three parts: performance as an invitee, performance and project planning for her own ensemble, and teaching both privately as well as in the university. A key component in her career development presents EEEmerging where one of the major takeaways for her was to turn the tables around: what is it that the presenter wants / needs as opposed to taking only one's own artistic visions into consideration when negotiating projects. This conversation surpasses mere program designing, it is also aimed at figuring out a common way to engage with audiences in various ways: possible teaching at local music schools or engaging with the presenter's social media accounts, etc.

Bariş Toker represents BT Arts, an agency devoted to providing space for fresh ideas and new ensembles in the early music scene. Drawing an analogy with the pop-music scene where it is common to accept influences from outside of the musical world, he is convinced the same can be done in the world of classical/early music. Toker finds the cooperating component between (in his case) agents and musicians to be of utmost importance. Active participation on the side of the artist is a pre-requisite. A persisting problematic in such a business model lies in the current higher educational system where students are almost exclusively guided in the direction of perfecting their craft, and not enough in building a successful "holistic" performer persona.

Romina Lischka feels somewhat uncomfortable with the current educational establishment most young musicians are exposed to from a very early age onward, which prompted her to find alternative ways of individual musical expression, ultimately devoting herself to the study of Indian classical music. One of the major take-aways from her on/off studies in India was the mode of knowledge transmission: the master-disciple relationship is still very strong, education / artistic training is viewed through the more traditional lens where teachers and students live together and the knowledge is transmitted orally. Such an intense holistic immersion into the study and practice has ultimately helped her in her Western music career as well, mostly in terms of immense concentration ability but also in developing a strong sense of self, advocating for the importance of one own's artistic vision as the key to creating a sustainable career. When connecting to outside agencies that could aid the individual artist trying to build a sustainable career we should inquire about their interests, networks and connect on a human level. Should the intuitive nature of the relationship feel strange, she advises to look for someone else.

Stef Coninx represents the Flanders Arts Institute, a government-funded organisation supporting artists in every stage of their career. They work as a guide/liaison for artists looking for either concert opportunities or funding options. Considering the career as a straight line is a mistake and a certain

amount of flexibility should be introduced into the thought process of what a career should be as well. Sharing the opinion of Baris Toker, Coninx too advocates for broader education of young artists which should surpass the mere advancing of one's artistic skills, raising the interesting point that artistic excellency should be understood as a prerequisite/condition and by no means a guarantee for success. Rethinking and reshaping of one self is necessary also in order to stop pursuing careers for which one might not be so well suited. Reflecting on what is best of the individual should be the lead in forming one's career.

OBSERVATIONS

• Performers need to be flexible and not just offer promoters 'take it or leave it' options. Think out of the box and assume that we are back to the baroque concept of any music being played on any instrument.

• A career needs a combination of having an individual speciality and a talent for clever networking. Programmes are now projects developed between programmers and artists.

• No agent can promise musicians the career they want. Conservatoires need to give more training sessions to students on management and career development. A career is not a straight line.

• It is important for a musician to have a strong individual idea of the story each wants to tell and follow that through in building a distinctive career. The EM movement has an enormously wide range of possibilities and tracks to follow. They require an investment of time and patience that will pay dividends in later years.

• Artistic relevance has to be constantly reimagined. There are more musicians than opportunities and money in the system, as is shown by the continuing decrease in average fees.

• Learn to jump between disciplines and follow the jazz advice that 'everything that happens on stage is part of the musical experience'.

• A career needs to carry on beyond novelty value. So many musicians are at their best in their mature years.

Jasmina Črnčič and Simon Mundy

PANEL

WHAT DO WE DO WITH EARLY MUSIC ON CD?

HOW HAS THE INDUSTRY EVOLVED SINCE THE BEGINNING OF THE EARLY MUSIC MOVEMENT, AND WHAT PLACE WILL RECORDINGS HOLD IN AN ARTIST'S PATH TOMORROW?

KATELIJNE BOON Klara
EMLYN STAM Orpheus Institute
CHARLES ADRIAENSSEN Outhere
ANNA BESSON traverso player, A Nocte Temporis

Charles Adriaenssen sets out by painting a picture of the substantial early music portfolio of Outhere Music, including that of specialized labels such as Ricercar, Ramée and Arcana as well as the more eclectic Linn and Alpha. 15 years ago, when Adriaenssen stepped on board of Outhere, the company was focusing on small ensembles, often with a personal link to Jérôme Lejeune - the founder and strongholder of Ricercar, who'll be celebrated for his work later on in the summit. The main thing that has changed, is Outhere Music's orientation towards a wider and larger target audience, spurring a more eclectic approach. "We wanted to take back from the majors what had become mainstream," Adriaenssen explains. Another side of reaching out to the audience, and creating a brand identity differentiating Outhere from the majors, has been the group's allegiance to performers with big personalities. They often enter the group's realm not as a result of scouting but of referral by existing partners. "The club grows with people who respect one another," says Adriaenssen. "We do look around beyond that realm, for instance at competitions such as MA festival's."

Anna Besson recently recorded an album for Alpha with Olga Pashchenko, featuring works by Kuhlau, Beethoven and Doppler. How does she select this music? "My heart goes to unknown repertoire, as we hear the masterpieces often enough. Add to that my belief that you should only record what you love, and you'll understand why for my latest record I chose romantic repertoire and performed it not on traverso, but on a 19th century flute."

While for Besson the HIP is to a large extent inspired by instruments, **Emlyn Stam** uses historical recordings as a point of departure.

He has accepted that working with the medium is like handling a double-edged sword: "Early recordings are important witnesses, yet not always acceptable to today's aesthetical standards," he explains, before sharing a sample from the first-ever commercially launched recording of a string quartet (Pathé, 1905). "This is nothing like the Haydn we've come to expect. It's totally out there and poses an immense challenge to our aesthetic sense. The experience only spurs more questions: do we strive for perfection or accept that there is no such standard from a historical point of view?" Fueled by his research, Stam makes a plea for personality in performance: "HIP as an idea is rooted in the 19th century, when the performer was considered as important as the spirit of the composer. I believe that creative performances result in creative recordings. We need to be daring, instead of thinking that by using the right instrument we're painting the complete picture."

Anna Besson sees how this approach would be challenging to today's audience: "Romantic performances are hard to listen to today. I appreciate their sense of freedom but also have found myself lost on some occasions! Olga and I chose an in-between way: we played freely but in a language that we both understand." Her first audio fragment leads back to 1990 with La Petite Bande performing Mozart's G major flute concerto. "I was 14 years old and knew this work from recordings by Rampal and other modern flutists. But I didn't really 'feel' it. When I heard this tape, I found exactly what I was looking for. It was my first real step into the early music world."

Adriaenssen's first pick looks back even further, to the 1950s. "This is one of the recordings that touched my heart when I was young. It features Kathleen Ferrier in a way that is stylistically difficult for us today, but still: what a voice"! Times and aesthetics have definitely changed, agrees Emlyn Stam: "If we want to be historically informed we have to ignore what critics think and focus on the evidence. And yes, this might mean going against the taste of the time."

The conversation turns back to recording anno 2020. Why would young artists embark upon such a venture in this day and age, and which issues might they encounter? Anna Besson: "Recordings help building your career with audience and organizers alike. It's a way to say: trust me, I am a good performer." The perks don't come without a price, Adriaenssen admits: "The only thing that hasn't changed is the adage 'time is money'. Time in the studio nowadays requires a substantial contribution of the artist to the production budget. This is why we see 'spontaneity' as an important trend: concerts are excellent opportunities to record. Nonetheless: good recordings will always be a luxury product. It's important to respect that inherent value, even now that the industry is shifting towards the digital. The convoluted income stream from platform to artist is problematic. Change is at hand, but we don't see a shift in the consumer pattern comparable to the normalization of organic shops yet. This is partly a matter of personal engagement, partly down to politics".

Then, what opportunities does the digital transformation offer to artists who want to go it alone in the recording industry? "People underestimate how crucial a label is in promoting and distributing recordings. In the current situation we see many people recording music in their kitchen, which is great as it keeps the contact with the audience alive. But it's not all good, because in a way the artists' revenue model is starting to self-destruct," Adriaenssen says.

A second round of beloved recordings ensues, with an eastern-flavored version of Monteverdi's *Vespers* by La Tempête from Adriaenssen, a Beethoven track from Anna Besson's album, and Dvořák's *American string quartet* chosen by Emlyn Stam. "In my research, recordings like this one from 1928 help to reconstruct historical performances. We use low-fi capturing to make the sound similar to what you hear on LPs." Would such an innovative approach stand a chance in Outhere's portfolio? Adriaenssen: "Why not?

The public wants to learn, is curious and eager to explore. Every recording involving a good story, an experiment, a different discipline, is interesting!" He prefers this approach to the trend of reissuing iconic recordings: "Majors will say that if something makes money, it is relevant. But by issuing compilations on the basis of statistics they are actually polluting the field."

Engineered perfection versus the imperfection of live performance, where does the heart of the panelists lie? Besson: "In the covid-era we are lucky to get any concerts at all, and more often than not they are streamed live. The outcome is a strange hybrid between a live and a recorded performance, that leaves no option to produce more than one take. That is daunting but unavoidable". Stam works with full takes only, in an attempt to come as close to the originals as possible. "Maybe we need to start recording low-fi more often, and rely less on perfect studio acoustics, allow for mistakes, embrace imperfections. That's no stranger than listening to an Ysaÿe -recording: it doesn't matter if he misses the mark now and then, it's personality that wins it every time." Adriaenssen prefers longer takes rather than editorial patchwork as well: "I don't have a philosophy. Some people strive for perfection and sound quality, others are touched by the live experience. As long as coughing or mistakes don't bother me, I prefer live recordings."

Going back to the future, the panelists express their hopes and dreams for the early music recording industry. Adriaenssen: "All in all we have a favorable environment. Everybody is HIP to a certain extent, dogmas are disappearing. I'm cautiously optimistic about the future of early music. It has a faithful audience, perhaps not entirely tuned to the digital yet, but there is growth potential." While Stam too adds a note of optimism pointing to new opportunities for audience development in the digital age, Besson remains more prudent: "I hope that despite declining budgets, the recording industry will keep enabling artists and audiences to discover new repertoires."

For artists just starting their journey, awards are no longer magical wands (Adriaenssen: "the impact has substantially decreased in the wake of the shrinking audience of classical music magazines") and the budget can be a dealbreaker. Besson: "I was lucky enough to get a proposal from a record label, so I didn't have to look for money. But I'm not sure if I would urge young colleagues to go for a label. Why not opt for a cheaper solution, find a spot on the internet and create something yourself?". "I just hope that young musicians don't give up and stick with it as long as they can," Stam adds. "My recommendation would be: work with conviction but realize that it is a tough world indeed." Adriaenssen: "I'm afraid I have to agree. And it's heartbreaking. We receive hundreds of requests from young musicians and try to take on several each year, but the selection is hard and the market for physical products is shrinking."

The session is rounded off with a short Q&A in which musician Nicolas Achten takes the conversation back to early music one last time: "Is it harder for young artists to emerge in the early music part of the industry or is the situation the same in other repertoires?". Adriaenssen offers a bittersweet analysis: "In this respect, there is a fundamental difference between digital and cd consumption. As to the latter: there is an established market for early music and basically anything can work. But we have to think of the digital as well, and unfortunately here the top recordings are those featuring iconic composers, even if it's the lousiest musicians taking them on. So for the time being, mainstream wins the online game".

Sofie Taes

FOCUS

THE BELGIAN EARLY MUSIC SCENE: PLAYING WITH LEGACY

STEF CONINX Kunstenpunt
BART DEMUYT Amuz
ELS MOENS Els & the artists
BENOÎT VANDEN BEMDEN bass player, Les Muffati

When it comes to supporting artists, expertise centers operating on government funding such as Kunstenpunt (Flanders, Belgium) are of vital importance. Kunstenpunt's **Stef Coninx** takes the lead in this panel session zooming in on the Belgian early music scene. Where is it at and which legacies are there to be dealt with? What are the perks and pitfalls of being in the sector, and in how far does the situation in Flanders differ from that in Brussels and the Walloon provinces? How can legislation and industry experts help the sector to face the increased challenges brought on by the pandemic and to move towards more sustainable practices so as to create a consistent local scene?

To investigate these and other issues, each panel member sets out with a SWOT-analysis of the current landscape. Possible points of interest proposed by Kunstenpunt include education, research, funding, recording and media, live performance, audience development, networking and distribution, knowledge sharing and capacity building. The panel guests represent many of these areas.

Els Moens: "I run a small artists agency and, representing several early music artists and ensembles, have familiarized myself with this particular scene. Among its strengths: specificity and depth of knowledge, the legacy from the early music pioneers, the presence of a large, loyal audience and the many excellent performers. Funding is a definite weakness, especially for young musicians, resulting in an imbalance with established artists. The ubiquity of new formats, digital initiatives and increasing attention to conservation practices open up new opportunities, yet we shouldn't overlook urgent threats such as the age of the audience,

the particularity of our political system and the decline of music education in day schools. The latter in particular worries me: how are we going to build an audience for the future if we don't start early on?"

Bart Demuyt: "I've entered the sector as a performer, became a festival and concert hall director and now am the lead of a research team specialized in early music. Recently, I've been taking a look at the present status of our local scene, collaborating with Kunstenpunt on the essay From historically informed performance to historically informed experience. What strikes me is that we have many opportunities in terms of media, research and technology - even in emerging fields such as Artificial Intelligence. Flanders is investing in research and education, allowing artists to continuously build knowledge and develop a critical position vis à vis the notion of 'truth' in early music. The rich inheritance of the early music pioneers, too, makes us privileged. Furthermore: early music is till sexy here and creativity comes in an astonishing range of forms and guises - from reconstruction to re-creation, cross-over and interdisciplinarity. Musicians from Belgium are engaging in networks and performing all over the world. Another strength is our higher education in the arts, boasting an academic component added to the artistic core. After the Kuijkens in Brussels and Jos van Immerseel in Antwerp, young musicians are doing a great job in our conservatories. A next step is to leave the floor to an even younger generation. And there is more work to be done: some musicians still have no interest in research results, despite their wide availability. I consider copycats to be another threat: if what a master says is always true, how can there be room for authenticity, individuality and creativity? Finally: our early music scene is busy and therefore highly competitive. There can only be enough space for young musicians if we invest accordingly."

Benoît Vanden Bemden: "Our country was at the heart of the early music revival and still profits from that position. Look, for instance, at some of our music schools, where substantial early music departments offer broad curricula, from sackbut to pianoforte! Another strength is the presence of the European Commission and Parliament in Brussels, putting us at the very center of European cultural practices. So even if our own market is small, we have easy access to international stages. On the other hand, we definitely suffer from the small country complex, always underestimating and undermining ourselves".

As the second part of the conversation pertains to the prerequisites of a viable early music scene, each panelist gets to pick one of the points of interest presented at the start of the conversation. Els Moens opts for live performance, questioning the sustainability of a market in which a growing number of musicians, with an incredible variety of skills, is active. For concert organizers and audiences alike, there is an almost limitless array of excellent projects to choose from. To the fierce competition can be added the issue of 'premieritis': organizers often want new and unique thematic programs, forcing artists to constantly reinvent themselves. A possible counterstrategy could be to establish regional concert networks such as the 'Seizoen Oude Muziek' in The Netherlands, allowing artists to perform the same program in a series of concerts. Another idea could be to stimulate emerging artist agencies, as the market has room for more and agents have proven to be instrumental in improving the artists' quality of life.

Bart Demuyt goes on to address the subject of funding. Because while early music festivals and concert series blossom and almost every concert hall is programming early music, the state subvention system is in need of rethinking and reshaping. Belgium's governmental situation is quite unique: culture is not a federal matter, but dealt with by three community governments and their respective funding mechanisms. Yet Demuyt holds on to an optimistic view on the future, believing there is money to be found

for early music. “Much more in Flanders than in Brussels and Wallonia”, says Benoît Vanden Bemden, “although the situation is improving”.

With the session drawing to a close, Belgium’s state structure yet again steers the conversation as panelists agree that the intercommunal mobility of artists is extremely limited, not helped by the fact that regional media tend to overlook artists from a different part of the country. “Our ensembles play abroad more often than across the language border,” Vanden Bemden confirms, stressing the importance of good distribution, international mobility and networks. The collaboration between Kunstenpunt and Wallonie/Bruxelles Musique at occasions such as Classical: Next really benefits the artists, as they help to widen their networks. The brand-new federation of independent Belgian ensembles Ambitus will henceforth strengthen these efforts and enhance Belgium’s motto that “l’union fait la force” (union is strength).

The session ends with a final round of the table listing three more desiderata for the Belgian early music scene: a framework of support (Moens), curiosity and audacity with programmers (Vanden Bemden), and a ‘real belief’ in early music (Demuyt). Food for thought from a dynamic trio of panelists, that - each having a past as a performer - in and of itself demonstrates that it takes versatility and persistence to build a sustainable music career in Belgium.

Sofie Taes

EARLY MUSIC SUMMIT

ONLINE

SATURDAY

21 NOVEMBER

EARLY MUSIC SUMMIT

MUSICOLOGY COURSE

EARLY MUSIC IN THE WEB AGE

JED WENTZ Leiden University
THEODORA PSYCHOYOU Sorbonne Université
JOHN GRIFFITHS CESR (Tours), University of Melbourne & Monash University
ANETA MARKUSZEWSKA University of Warsaw
DINKO FABRIS Teatro di San Carlo, Napoli

Jed Wentz's main task is to connect the academic research field with festival programming. Utrecht Early Music Festival's main platform for reassessing the evolution of the early music revival, and several other aspects connected to it such as audience evaluation, is the annual STIMU SYMPOSIA. Wentz has been leading these sessions since 2012. They broadened their activities to enlarge the discursive nature of the festival by introducing sessions where performers and researchers could speak about the newest research, they also changed the concert programming in a way that the performers can now talk with the audience after their performance. The future includes a new research festival, called *The Utrecht Early Theatre Festival* (2022—2026).

Theodora Psychoyou emphasises the instant availability of many musical and academic sources through the number of open or subscription-based platforms such as JSTOR, IMSLP, ResearchGate and others. Finding the information however is not enough — now more than ever it is necessary to teach young researchers and performers how to navigate this large pool of knowledge and how to effectively single out the relevant/correct informations. She also conducts an interdisciplinary project on experimental, virtual, archeological acoustics, examining the space surrounding the usual reconstruction of musical practices. Their programme also includes distance learning programmes from before the beginning of the pandemic.

John Griffiths is the former director of early music at the University of Melbourne. He presented an interdisciplinary project which he began in 1984 to record music of the 14th century. For this he gathered a group of experts from various medieval studies fields who assisted performers by informing them in their respected fields before the recordings were produced. The digitalisation process could lift such collaborations on an even higher level. He is also a researcher of the Spanish vilhuela and he created an online database where he publishes every type of information on the vilhuela that he gathered during the years of his research. By providing the information in the format of such a database he hopes to create a triangular conversation between readers, authors and source materials. He is also preparing a tablature encyclopaedia, seeing potential in

handling such sources with the help of various notational softwares and hoping that one day a notational software could be designed for people who don't read music notated in tablatures. Such a software could provide an instant transcription of the tablature into modern mensural notation.

Aneta Markuszewska of the University of Warsaw spoke about the history of a score of Domenico Scarlatti's opera *Tetide in Sciro*, the research that has been done on this particular example and its performance history. She further spoke about the connection of opera arrangements and digital humanities on the example of an international collaboration project between researchers in Germany and Poland, called *Pasticcio*, originally a historical term which defines the arranging of attractive popular operas. Their project includes the migration of sources, artists and musical styles, ways of adapting works to suit the local tastes. This opens a new perspective on baroque music which shows an affinity towards innovation, transformation and modernisation. They are also preparing digital editions of a few selected pasticcios, an online database and a collection of essays.

Jasmina Črnčič

MUSICOLOGY COURSE

CURRENT TRENDS IN CRITICAL EDITING

DINKO FABRIS Teatro di San Carlo
MASSIMILIANO GUIDO Università degli Studi di Pavia, Cremona
CAMILLA CAVICCHI CESR (Tours)
ALVARO TORRENTE Universidad Complutense de Madrid/ICCMU Spain
PHILIPPE VENDRIX CNRS/ Université de Tours
ANNETTE THEIN Bärenreiter Verlag

INTRODUCTORY VIDEO AND PODCAST

Philippe Vendrix offered the introductory video in which he discussed the close relationship between musicians and musicologists, reminding us that we are all a part of one shared ecosystem, consisting not only of performers and academics but also of the amateurs and the public. He further pointed to the current state calling for a reexamination of the role that musicians and musicologists play today, claiming that the situation in the 21st century is not the same anymore as in the early days of the early music movement. A possible way forward includes the introduction of the so-called "performance doctorates" certain universities already offer. A second necessary development includes the use of new technologies such as sound studies, social media, etc.

In *the Early Music Podcast*, **Margaret Bent** emphasised the need for performers' participation not only in the process of closing the work cycle by ultimately delivering the work to an audience but also in approaching musicologists for an active collaboration and possible tutoring when working on special projects where an extended knowledge of the repertoire is necessary.

PANEL SUMMARY

The panel was opened by a representative of Bärenreiter Verlag, **Annette Thein**, who presented the current situation of their company, also how it was impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic. One of the main questions she received from Dinko Fabris, was: What do musicians expect from a critical edition today? Some of the newer demands include: availability (pdf, sent via email), flexibility of the musical text itself (preparing transpositions, adding additional elements, printing larger formats, etc.)... and, increasingly, additional information (performance traditions of the time, adding the composer's handwriting). The rapid growth of the technologies available for musicians and musicologists to prepare their own editions has proven to be a competition for print-publishing houses such as Bärenreiter. Such endeavours may in some cases not only lead further away from historical critical editing but also signal a kind of abuse of cultural sponsorship, ultimately endangering the scholarship.

Massimiliano Guido of Cremona shortly presented the history of his institution, it being the first higher education institution which offered a study course in paleography and music philology. The interest peak in early music research happened in the 1980's/1990's and then slowly declined. Besides still preparing 'monumenta' editions, they are also following the new trend of more focused, individual work on smaller projects. In conclusion he presented his project *Tastata*, an open database for organists and harpsichordists which in its flexible format allows for a more personal input from individual artists in what they believe belongs into a critical edition / what should be edited in the first place. This approach also allows a more fluid merging of not just musicology but also organology and practice.

Alvaro Torrente presented his work on the critical editions of the Cavalli operas, collaborating also with Bärenreiter. This project connects a team of international musicologists, converting challenges of critical and performance editions. Another publishing project involved ICCMU, Madrid's main publishing house for historical music. Among other things Torrente published a series of 12 dance songs from the 17th century. In terms of critical editing this project is interesting since its base is reconstruction work as this type of music was traditionally orally transmitted. Finally, he presented the DIDONE project which deals with music set to eight libretti of Pietro Metastasio. The team is working on around 3000 arias, offering the materials for scholars and performers free of charge. One of the aims of this project is to examine the different expressions of emotions in music with the same underlaying text (sometimes as much 40 different musical versions of the same libretto exist).

Camilla Cavicchi works in the CNRS *Ricercar* program in musicology which includes research projects, publications, exhibitions and collaboration with performers. Their editions are available online in various formats free of charge. She further presented the set up of their website, explaining how to navigate it. They also work in reconstruction projects, outsourcing collaborators which are all specialists in renaissance music. She also presented the CRIM project — *Citations: The Renaissance Imitation Mass Project* where the format of material dissemination is similar as with *Ricercar*. Both of these projects offer a valuable view into how the digitalisation process can provide valuable tools for the perfection of the critical editing processes: the so-called dynamic editions are interactive, they offer music scores in various formats, they allow for a more in-depth cross-referencing research with possible contrafacta examples, when available, they also offer audio samples, etc. Finally she presented the *Gesualdo Online project*, concerned with providing the entire opus of the renaissance composer Carlo Gesualdo da Venosa.

Closing remarks by **Philippe Vendrix** summarised the need for an evolution in how musicologists working on critical editions will include the process of digitalisation into their work.
He emphasised the need for the upholding of quality. We must ask how digitalisation will be perceived and remind ourselves that musicology must ultimately evolve into a fully collaborative science.

Jasmina Črnčič

PROMOTERS COURSE

THE PERKS OF PROGRAMMING EARLY MUSIC: HOW TO TALK TO CONCERTS PROMOTERS

ARTUR MALKE Malke Music Management
ALICE ORANGE Festival de Sablé
RAQUEL ANDUEZA Semana de Música Antigua de Estella
TOMAS BISSCHOP MA Festival, Bruges

Programming early music around Europe has changed over the last decade, reaching parts of the continent where period instrument practice and repertoire exploration were relatively rare. There is still a gap between North West Europe, where in some parts of the repertoire it is now dominant, and South East Europe, where it is still scene as something of an exotic speciality. In some countries it is now a three generation movement, in others the first generation is just reaching established status.

Equally varied is the level of public money support. Only in France, Belgium, the UK and the Netherlands are there ensembles that are treated in roughly the same way as the 'mainstream' classical music institutions. For most subsidy trickles down via venues, festivals and projects. In some places cities are more supportive than central or regional governments. This has two main effects. It makes the professional context of a musician in early music less stable than many but it also leads to less static expectations of programming. Perhaps because Early Music is still a Movement rather than a Tradition, it may be expected to be more innovative; with programmers interested in projects that are much more than just a list of well-known works.

OBSERVATIONS

• Musicians are living in the market and that is almost a sports arena. Musicians are doing anything to get noticed and programmers are becoming like team managers; shaping careers.

• Pathways to subsidy are diametrically different from country to country and region to region. For example, much of Spain (where support for the arts is devolved to regions, as it is in Germany, Belgium and the UK) there is no settled route. In France the regions play an important part too and regional networking is encouraged, however an ensemble has to have two years pedigree and a non-musician professional administrator to qualify.

• In Belgium, perhaps the most crowded early music scene in the world, Flanders has a more generous record than Wallonia in subsidising ensembles, reflecting the leading role Flemish musicians and cities have played in developing the early music field in the last half century.

• In Poland, although it now has the most active early music sector in Eastern Europe, ensembles are largely dependent on the market, although some cities are developing home grown ensembles and residencies.

• Because of this wide range of support standards and systems, it is vital for musicians to research the tastes and interests of festival directors and venue programmers. Taste is not an indication of quality judgements but it does dictate the direction of bookings. Personal relationships are crucial, as are understanding of the limitations on budget and concert dates that programmers control.

• Each programmer has an individual preference for contact. Some like personal introductions, some insist on hearing an ensemble live. Some are happy to look at printed material, some prefer online and others like the certainty of a physical CD so that they can listen in different surroundings without headphones and the internet.

• Equally, programmers differ as to who they like to negotiate with. Some like to talk to the artist directly and talk after a concert (as one put it, 'no drinks after, no hanging out, means no dreaming', and another said 'the first approach should be about art, not money'). Others prefer to talk to an agent, feeling they can say what they really think without giving offence and can be more open about money issues.

Simon Mundy

PROMOTERS COURSE

WHY FEATURE EARLY MUSIC?

AGLAJA THIESEN B'Rock Orchestra
RICHARD HEASON St John's Smith Square, London
ELINA ALBACH Harpsichordist, Continuum
LOUWRENS LANGEVOORT Intendant and CEO Kölner Philharmonie, KölnMusik GmbH
LIBBY PERCIVAL Founder/Manager Percius Management

REMA vice-president **Richard Heason** moderates this discussion in which a quartet of panelists will add wood to the fire that was lightened in the session's motto: "Don't be scared to tell a promoter to not be scared!". Because despite early music approaches permeating the broader music scene, specialized artists continue to find it hard to get programmed outside of conventional venues. "For every festival programming early music, there are ten that don't," Heason sets out. The start of a lively discussion in which sharing first-hand experiences of success and failure will translate into tips & tricks on how to convince more people to give early music a try.

"We need to create a rich and vibrant infrastructure, that helps to build bridges with non-specialized organizers by showing how relevant early music is. Such a structure will also help to respond to today's challenges, among which the green agenda, career planning and challenged mobility are the most stringent. Unless we can persuade more organizers to program early music, ideally embedded in a local tour or a range of adjacent activities, we will not be able to improve upon our sector's sustainability".

Harpsichordist **Elina Albach**, who founded the ensemble Continuum in 2015, continuously searches for new ways to perform 'old' music. "Let me share three examples of what I found to be successful. The first is a project from a few years back that focused on 'vanitas' and its contemporary reflections. Texts were by David Foster Wallace, the music a combination of baroque and hiphop performed on early instruments. In collaboration with rapper Kate Tempest, this became a meeting of two artistic realms and a conversation between styles. The same can be said for a program that combined Monteverdi's *Vespers* with work by Missy Mazzoni, again arranged for early music ensemble. For our version of Bach's *St. John Passion*, we converted the score into a scenario for tenor, percussionist and harpsichord.
The three performers were joined in the chorales by the audience, amounting to a music experience that was familiar and new at the same time. I believe that, in all three cases, we were able to attract attention with novel formats rooted in our artistic practice. Artistic conviction is of crucial importance, because without it you're just trying to sell an assembly of gimmicks."

Percius Management founder **Libby Percival** adds to the formula for (potential) success: "What makes projects compelling in my eyes is the integrity of the program, the passion of the artist and the quality of performance, whether that involves early music or not. I am, by the way, not a user of this term and seriously question whether it does us any favors. Every artist and manager should continuously investigate what audiences want to hear and how to give it to them. Having an eye for 21st century contexts and means to reach out, is an integral part of that. So perhaps the way to increase early music distribution is not changing what we do, but the way in which we do it. I also believe in strengthening the value propositions of early music. Why would you want to hear Vivaldi's *Four Seasons* from early music people instead of a big orchestra? I say: it's about intimacy, about taking the music back to what it was and breathing new life into it. It's breadth - not only of sound but of experience - and that we do have in spades. A project from I Fagiolini (one of the ensembles Percival manages, ST) could serve as an example: *Betrayal. A Polyphonic Crime Drama* was based on music by Gesualdo - not the easiest repertoire. We wanted people to experience it in a different way and played with the concert's narrative framework as well as the spatial position of the audience. We found that promotors responded well to this out-of-the-box approach".

"We at B'Rock Orchestra also have experience in selling content that could be considered somewhat 'tricky'," **Aglaja Thiesen** says. "Things I have found useful in trying to convince programmers to take a risk include an adage I stick to religiously: if you want to sell, then listen first. Do your best to understand a potential partner before presenting your ideas. Be prepared. Who are they? What's their strategy? Look for things that connect you, rather than set you apart: if you express distance ('Why don't you have early music in your program?'), you might just ruin your chances. I further recommend to believe in the power of a good anchor point: a joint interest of yourself and the organizer, to which you might be able to attach your project. Sometimes this is star power, popular repertoire in a challenging setting, a festival theme or programming line, etcetera. Genre-crossing can be a strong anchor point too, as are considerations regarding participation and inclusivity. Offering extra value to a partner, is incentivizing him to program you. A third tip is to use storytelling to build bridges: a good story can open many doors, especially with non-specialized organizers. Think of early music legends such as Jordi Savall and Christina Pluhar, who made storytelling their trademark. Finally, convincing programmers is a matter of respect: if you want a potential partner to think out of the box, you should be willing to do the same".

Libby Percival agrees that absorbing what a partner wants is of crucial importance: " There is no point in trying to fit a round peg in a square hole by selling a product that doesn't fit the partner's bill, especially as the end goal should be to establish a long-term relationship. Language is also important: try to remove boxed concepts and assumptions. Get people to talk about the messages they want to convey, because - after all - communicating is what being a musician is about. I also believe that 'extras' connected with education and social responsibility have added value for an organizer".

The panel dives deeper into the issue of reaching out to programmers with unknown repertoire. How to get them hooked, knowing that glossy brochures are not working but unusual concert formulas just might? Elina Albach: "In my experience, it's the organizer who is often hesitant to program 'obscure' repertoire, while audiences tend to be curious and open-minded, happy to hear something different. I say: dare to be crazy, especially with people you already know. They can help you putting the wheels in motion. This is what happened with our *St. John Passion*: it started with just a few festivals but ended up being booked by 20 more! Saying that, I do realize that for many musicians - especially those without

an agent - the first step to a potential partner is a giant leap."

Libby Percival: "When it comes to reaching out to promotors you don't know, this is my top tip: pick up the phone. It might seem basic but an e-mail just won't do. Prepare, establish contact and start a conversation. You'll find that everybody likes to talk about their dreams and passions. Of course questions will be asked, as for these promotors the bombardment with projects is real. So ask yourself: why am I doing this and why now? If you can answer, you'll sell".

Getting the ball rolling often isn't the final hurdle to take. How to deal with an organizer requesting exclusivity, for instance? Aglaja Thiesen: "This is problematic indeed. I believe the covid-situation has created a momentum to question such practices, but as to what could be an alternative I have no answer at present. Building networks could be the grain of a sustainable future, as is improving on communication: we need to explain better what our needs are and why it is important for organizers to support us."

Sofie Taes

AEC COURSE

ARTISTIC TRAINING

ISAAC ALONSO DE MOLINA Royal Conservatoire The Hague
ANNA DANILEVSKAIA Sollazzo Ensemble
JEAN-CHRISTOPHE FRISCH Le Baroque Nomade, Sorbonne Université
PETER VAN HEYGHEN Royal Conservatoire Brussels,
Royal Conservatorium The Hague, Conservatorium van Amsterdam

This AEC-curated session reviewed the fundamental questions before starting to teach Early Music in a Conservatoire:
What is the importance of being historically informed in live and recorded performance? What is the relationship between the subjective and objective aspects of music, research and the actual performance? Is there a dichotomy between theory and artistic practice? How does EM/HiP/HP contribute in a meaningful way to society? What is the role of vocation in music and how can or should we be encouraging and nurturing this? "Keeping it live" – are we currently experiencing the death of live music? Will the consumer miss the live experience if they've never had it? Can the current digital world enhance our experience in EM/HiP/HP?

The Panel Session started with three insightful presentations from Peter van Heyghen, Jean-Cristophe Frisch and Anna Danilevskaia about early music teaching and learning, the relationship between research and performance, as well as the process of digitisation and its influence on the world of Historically Informed Performance. A term "Culturally Informed Performance" was proposed by **Peter van Heyghen** who was first to present his speech on Early music. According to him, this term reflects much better the essence of early music, as it underlines that music is a reflection of both stylistic and cultural context. It can be used in relation to music from all cultures being perceived as different.

The world of Early music has always connected with originality, innovation, and character on the one hand, and a tedious museum-oriented approach on the other hand. This was discussed in-depth during the session. In addition, the role of a teacher in inspiring students to become passionate about what they are doing and get interested in musical compositions they are playing was discussed in relation to early music.

Another important question was posed during the panel discussion – the future of early music in the digital world and the world of coronavirus epidemic. Does the current pandemic pose a threat to early music performances? According to musicians, digitisation has opened new possibilities for musicians to perform and attract new audiences aspiring to discover the uniqueness

of the early music world, yet surely the epidemic is an issue of increasing concern for musicians usually performing on the stage.

According to **Jean-Christophe Frisch**, it is vitally important for students to increase their knowledge by going back to sources and develop their critical thinking rather than just training for performing on the stage, as sportsmen do.
To teach about a meaningful way of becoming a musician is the main goal music professors should aspire to achieve. It should however be noted that any musicological knowledge is questionable.
The image of musicians is constantly changing due to globalization and the digitalization processes. For instance, a musician today should not only care about the art of performance but also about the viral image created by social media pages and websites.

Anna Danilevskaia emphasized the importance of a balance between practice and theory in a student's schedule, as well as research as a tool opening doors and providing students with more inspiring ideas for giving their own musical interpretation. At the same time, questioning musical decisions we are taking could be advantageous, as questioning is the beginning of knowledge, and therefore a brilliant music performance.

AEC

AEC COURSE

THE FUTURE OF EARLY MUSIC DEPARTMENTS

LINDE BRUNMAYR-TUTZ University of Music Trossingen
CLAIRE MICHON Pôle Aliénor Poitiers
ASHLEY SOLOMON Royal College of Music London
ISAAC ALONSO DE MOLINA Royal Conservatoire The Hague
KELLY LANDERKIN Schola Cantorum Basiliensis
VITTORIO GHIELMI Mozarteum University, Salzburg
PEDRO SOUSA SILVA ESMAE Porto
OCTAVIE DOSTALER-LALONDE Ensemble Postscript

This second session curated by AEC offers an opportunity to work in small groups on themes such as: Is it necessary to have a more precise definition of EM/HiP/HP within the education sector, or is EMHiP/HP enough as a definition? What has EM/HiP/HP brought to the Conservatoire paradigm? How would the cultural life within the Conservatoire be different had there been no EM/HiP/HP in the last 40/50 years? How has the Conservatoire paradigm influenced/shaped/affected the world of EM/HiP/HP? What is the future of EM/HiP/HP department/faculty? Is it necessary to have separate department/faculty within institutions or should they be absorbed into the modern music department/faculty. What is Early Music's relationship with elitism and excellence and what do we hope to achieve for future generations of students?

KELLY LANDERKIN + CLAIRE MICHON

What is the role of teaching on the way we play the early music? What is our connection with the music we perform and what kind of a relationship do we want to develop with our audience? If Titanic is the metaphor of the world of classical music, who would be the survivors of the catastrophe we are witnessing today? Can the term "Early Music" be considered as obsolete and not relevant in the modern epoch? All of these questions marked the discussion with Kelly Landerkin moderated by Claire Michon, which entailed an exchange of experiences, best practices and inspiring ideas on the topics of early music education providing a lot of food for thought.
Questions from the audience about the methods of teaching and the client-oriented approach towards students were posed promoting fruitful discussions with several conclusions drawn.

First of all, a balance between theory and practice is essential in achieving excellence in performance. One of the significant achievements of the Early Music Movement was to approach music in a more holistic way. In other words, we have to incorporate the didactical methods of historical music pedagogy in order to bring something new to the music while performing through a process of spontaneous creation.

In addition, the issue of performing spaces was thoroughly discussed in relation to the changing contexts. Being close to local communities while performing early music could be a decisive factor in defining how the performing space should look like.

Integration of Early Music Departments within larger institutional structures is vital, yet it is also quite important to be provided an opportunity to immerse completely into the world of early music, which is usually a stand-alone house offering. Finally, the idea of elitism should not be connected with an excellent historical performance paradigm.

VITTORIO GHIELMI + ASHLEY SOLOMON

A discussion with Vittorio Ghielmi moderated by Ashley Solomon provoked a lot of questions and answers from the audience regarding the positive and negative sides of the creation of separate departments of Early Music, the role of research in inspiring students for discovering the new ways of performing, as well as the relevance of the term “early music”.

Even though “early music” as a term is very practical due to its advantages for a fast communication, it can be seen as too narrow for defining all the complexities of the experiences we have witnessed during the last years.

Musicological research should feed and inspire artistic skills. At the same time, we should not be afraid of experimenting and trying different ways of performing without going beyond certain limitations. There should be always a line between pure research and practice, which are completely different activities not to be judged by using criteria related to research.

Early Music students can explore further repertoire and different traditions, including contemporary music. It would enable them to discover “new” techniques and aesthetics while experimenting and taking an active part in the music creation process. An intelligent collaboration with different departments can be advantageous, however there are always some limitations in crossing borders which should be taken into consideration, as a mixture of different genres is not always justified. At the same time, standardisation in teaching, that has been always a huge trap for musicians ,should be avoided.

Regarding the creation of separate departments of Early Music, the question remains very controversial. According to Vittorio Ghielmi, there is no need for a separate department, as the conscience of the historical development of music should become omnipresent in teaching and learning.

PEDRO SOUSA SILVA + ISAAC ALONSO DE MOLINA

Questions from Isaac Alonso de Molina about the role of attention given by the performer to the process and the outcome itself launched this session marked by insightful discussions and exchanges of ideas on the topic of early music departments.

Multiple questions about the role of ethics in music education, challenges of promoting the interest in the history of music, as well as the problem of career-oriented approach of young musicians not willing to dig deeper into theory and the history of early music were asked.
The two key pillars of the musical performance experience are understanding and integrating learnt concepts into the sensorial experience

of musicians. Going into more detail, musicians should aspire not only to gain knowledge about the historical background of music they are playing but also to perceive the concepts and incorporate them while performing on the stage. Yet student's mistakes can be very helpful in developing our individual approaches of music performing, according to Pedro Sousa e Silva.

The controversy between freedom and security was underlined during the discussion, as musician's perception of the balance between these two aspects can differ a lot, and a fully instructive approach can be a trap for Early Music departments.

Interestingly, a transition from the Historically Informed Performance to the Historically Formed Performer can be underlined. Another noticeable tendency is that early music is increasingly becoming "a label of sonority", which is promoted by the increasing popularity of early music festivals.

The session was followed by comparisons of different modes of teaching in the past and their influence on our current perception of early music, and discussions with Q&A about obstacles musicians might face while playing early music.

OCTAVIE DOSTALER-LALONDE + LINDE BRUNMAYR-TUTZ

The idea of synergy of departments in music education has been discussed in-depth during the session with Octavie Dostaler-Lalonde moderated by Linde Brunmayr-Tutz. Not only a range of difficulties in cross-departmental cooperation within Higher Music Institutions were underlined during the session but also challenges of early music learning and teaching were presented.
There are always challenges in defining the term of "early music". The excellence in performing music is a good development, yet the main goal is to help students to develop creativeness and to think critically about what is written, as nothing is set in stone.

Regarding the organisational structure of Early Music Departments within Higher Music Education Institutions, it should be said that the line between the departments of Modern Music and Early Music should be blurred. This could lead to some problems in establishing Early Music department within Higher Music Institutions in terms of the organisational structure and the mode of interaction between them.

There are always some difficulties in finding connections between the world of Modern music and Early Music. There is no common language between musicians specialised in the early 17th century music and those who study for example Dmitri Shostakovich.

Students should be given freedom in choosing subjects they wish to study regardless of their specialisation and their faculty. It can promote their ability to develop their own styles of performing and understanding the interconnectedness of various music genres while enabling them to use different tools for music making. Some experimental programmes were noted during the session as exemplary for the 21st century music teaching methods.

AEC

INSTRUMENT MAKERS COURSE

LUTHIERS BATTLE

HÉLÈNE HOUZEL CRR93 Aubervilliers La Courneuve
ODILE EDOUARD CNSM Lyon
ARNAUD GIRAL violin maker

Beyond the mere organological curiosity of the Freiberg violins , this discussion was dedicated to the idea of the consort and violin band. Though the word “consort“ is more often used in relation with viola da gamba or flutes, a few experimentations were done in the last years: for educative purposes in Aubervilliers with Hélène Houzel, and for professional performance with Odile Édouard and Les Sonadori.

The violin was indeed not born from the genius of a single creator, but rather it is the answer to a need, that of having a band of stringed instruments (from top to bass) having the sound capacity to be used outdoors, unlike the consort of violas da gamba, reserved for intimate and private use.

On the instigation of **Hélène Houzel**, the Aubervilliers CRR has equipped itself with a band of 4 violins based on Freiberg instruments: a small three-string top, a top, a tenor and a small bass. This was before all an educational project. Unlike teaching focused on individual practice of the violin, sometimes isolating, playing in consort opens up a very wide range of learning. Gesture and listening become central and fill in an educational gap. Accuracy, intonation and some form of personal development complete this approach. Hélène compares the simple and rustic aspect of Freiberg violins with her way of approaching the Renaissance repertoire: losing her certainties and accepting to be destabilized, both sonically and technically, provides a multitude teaching to students. With an unusual sound, this violin consort is not easy to love, but once this peculiarity is overcome it becomes a working tool with many possibilities.

The Sonadori ensemble was initially based on theoretical work carried out by Alain Gervreau. As part of his thesis research, he noticed that in the 1530s each Venetian Scuola Grande had its own professional violin band. This lead to the creation of a 6 Renaissance violins band, in order to put into practice the theoretical work carried out upstream. As they called on several luthiers to constitute their consort, it is by nature more motley than the Aubervilliers consort, but it also contains violins based on theFreiberg instruments, and tackles a broad repertoire from dancing music to sacred music. In addition to the emulation provided by this professional activity, Odile offers her students at the CNSMD in Lyon the experience provided by this practice of playing together.

The new directions opened by this research, both from approaching a specific repertoire and from using an unusual instrumentarium and thus diving into organological research, seems to bear these fruits with the younger generations, which we can only be enthusiastic about.

Arnaud Giral

INSTRUMENT MAKERS COURSE

KEEPING THE PAST PLAYABLE: THE MECHANICS OF HISTORIC SEMIMOBILE KEYBOARD INSTRUMENTS

JURN BUISMAN Geelvinck Music Museum
ALAIN ROUDIER Ad Libitum
HELMUT BALK Greifenberger Institut für Musikinstrumentenkunde
PAUL MCNULTY musician and instrument maker

While string players gravitate to instruments that date from the 18th century, as much aand are happy to use them as their everyday 'partner' (whether modified or not), those working with old keyboards are more wary.

First, fewer instruments have survived the upheavals of the last two centuries in workable conditions. Then, the stresses and tensions on the components of early keyboard instruments, especially the experimental models of piano, makes tampering with them, even in the course of normal performance, dangerous for their integrity.

This session gathered together some of the best known names in keyboard reconstruction, research and imitation to discuss the advisability and practicality of dealing with old keyboards, as well as the need for new blood in the profession. It quickly emerged that what musicians and promoters want is not always in the best interests of the instruments.

OBSERVATIONS

• Keep original instruments for study, not performance. Use copies to provide the experience of their sound because once an old instrument is restored, it will just sound old. It will not have the same characteristics it had when it was new. While string instruments mellow and mature, keyboards just age.

• The original artefact is to precious and fragile to be risked. Instead, solid science is needed to assess and recreate the instrument. Everything can be measured and, with patience, reconstructed. An reasonable copy can be made once an original soundboard is understood.

• When the EM movement began most fortepianos were sitting unwanted in antique shops. No they are in demand but adequate documentation is a problem. As the demand expands there is need for deeper and more comprehensive research. It would also be useful to know what instruments are still in private hands, not as collector's items but as prized but unrestored furniture.

• Restoring anything made before 1800 is not a good idea because of rarity and fragility. From the early Romantic period on instruments are more commonly available and often more robust, so restoration is an option.

• Restoration depends on the condition of the soundboard; it may have a couple of centuries left in the wood, like a violin, but the rigours of concert life means that it must have enough structural integrity to keep it going. The skill and knowledge of the restorer is key – as one maker said 'when a violin is restored it is not done by the gardener'.

• Where early instruments are required to perform is also important. It is ridiculous to expect a Graf or Walther to be heard in an 800 seat hall. Even in the early Romantic period, pianos were rarely played for more than 300 people – and that was in Paris. Usually the rooms were smaller salons and the pianos were played with their lids closed. For big halls, use a Steinway that was built for them.

• It's important the contemporary composers start using early keyboards to keep the instruments alive as part of music's continuum. With the modern copies there is no reason why they cannot be part of the composer's toolkit.

• There is a shortage of trained makers. Too many in the profession are now 'too mature' and the skills need to be passed on. However taking an apprentice is expensive. The music business as a whole needs to invest in the makers of the future. The number of makers and restorers is decreasing while the number of EM performers is increasing. Soon they will not have enough reliable instruments to play on.

• Alongside the makers themselves, there is a real shortage of technicians, able to keep the new 'old' instruments in condition and up to concert standard. This is particularly true for smaller venues and festivals.

• The restoration and making craft needs more institutional support. At the moment too much of the work is dependent on private initiatives. There is a need for conservatoires and universities to have 'restorers in collaboration', and for makers to be able to host artists in residence.

Simon Mundy

DUO

BACH ON PIANO: DO YOU HAVE A PERMIT?

STEF GRONDELAERS linguist and music journalist
NATACHA KUDRITSKAYA pianist
ANDREAS STAIER keyboard player
ANTHONY ROMANIUK keyboard player
REMBRANDT FRERICHS composer, pianist
SARAH JEFFERY recorder player, Team Recorder

THE BACH-ON-PIANO DEBATE: TAPPING THE WALLS OF HIP

Music critic **Stefan Grondelaers**, session moderator, puts the cat among the pigeons with a question at the crux of the HIP debate: can you play Bach on a piano? "It's a strange question when you come to think of it," Grondelaers says, "because one could play Bach on anything. But is it possible to respect his intentions if you opt for something other than a harpsichord…?"

Pianist **Natacha Kudritskaya** doesn't dismiss the idea, but sees the value proposition in working with early instruments. Having studied in the Soviet Union, it was only during her early days in Paris that she experienced the perks of the historical keyboard. "I started to explore early repertoire with the instruments as my guide. It was like a light emanated from them! At last I understood why tempi, characteristics, ornamentations often don't make sense on a modern piano. This is how I see the use of instruments contemporary to the music: they lead you onto the right path."

"My approach is slightly different," says **Andreas Staier.** "Perhaps I'm less confident that the harpsichord solves so many problems, and that baroque music can't be performed well on piano. What I do agree with is that students of the modern piano should be encouraged to play early music. It is important to know where it all started."

Staier also concurs with Grondelaer's statement that knowledge allows for freedom in expression: "Playing baroque music on period instruments is nothing like following a recipe. You have to learn the language as the notes alone don't tell you anything. To me this is a far more basic point than the question if you should or should not play early music on a modern instrument. As to the latter, there is no general answer: it's a piece-by-piece consideration, especially when it comes to Bach. It's not always clear on which keyboard instrument his works should be performed. Some are clearly destined for the organ or harpsichord, but what if there is truth in C.P.E. Bach's statement about the clavichord being his

father's favorite? Perhaps this was the intended star of *Das Wohltemperierte Klavier*?".

Anthony Romaniuk joins in with a reflection on his preparatory video, in which he highlights three parameters: resonance, as piano and harpsichord have very different resonance constructions; ornamentation, which is to a large extent related to resonance; and dynamics as a vital part of the same continuum. Staier partly disagrees, noting that while acoustics and ornamentation are definitely interrelated (think of early modern harpsichords, which sounded so bad that heavy ornaments were a must) but not in an unequivocal, cause-and-effect sort of way: "Composers like d'Anglebert ornamented even more than Bach, while some of his colleagues didn't at all. Some French organ pieces are more heavily ornamented than works for harpsichord. So I think that ornamentation is not so much influenced by the instrument as it is part of the internal hearing of a composer. Therefore, there is no clear separation between different keyboard instruments from an ornamentation point of view." Apart from historical and acoustical reasoning, physiological experience and intuition play a role as well. Kudritskaya: "On the piano intuition is what guides me in terms of ornamentation. Call it a touristic and sensatory approach."

After Romaniuk clarifies that he was mostly pointing to the execution of ornaments depending on the instrument type instead of the ornamentation as such, musician-composer **Rembrandt Frerichs** shares some insights from the realms of jazz and Persian music. Here too, a discussion about the connection between ornamentation styles and instruments is ongoing and experiences on what works or not reflect the different stances taken by the panelists. Staier embraces this point of view: "I followed a course on raga music once, which demonstrated that the polyphonic and harmonic complexity of Western music has come at the price of standardization and simplification. The Arabic tradition of ornamentation is ten times richer."

Anna Danilevskaia, who's at home not so much in Bach as she is in medieval oeuvres, endorses the importance of being open to what artists outside of the early music biotope can bring to the table: "I regularly work with people who have no experience with medieval music. I love it! The freshness of their perspective manifests in an approach to music that I find inspiring. I learn a lot from them and believe that, in a philosophical way, their experience is as valid as mine."

The Q&A continues with matters of semantics and linguistics (not surprising given the moderator's field of expertise), touching upon concepts such as 'translation' between instruments, 'appropriation' of repertoire on modern instruments as an argument used by 'fundamentalist' HIP proponents, and the heavy weight of a word as little as 'only'. Recorder player **Sarah Jeffery**: "I object to talking about performance in terms of 'only': only Bach on the harpsichord, only this and only that... My basic opinion is that of course we should try different types of music on different instruments." "Thanks to Sarah for what she said," responds Staier "and in principle I totally agree. But different approaches will result in performances of different quality. There is so much commercial shit around. Take the cross-over fashion, which started with genius musicians coming together in revelatory projects but unfortunately spurred an avalanche of ignorant, terrible things."

The conversation finally turns to older repertoire in relation to more recent music. **Natacha Kudritskaya**: "In a sense, 'younger' music is easier to tackle: we do have an idea of how to play Liszt, Brahms or Rachmaninov, and every musician with a good background and a healthy brain can find out what their intentions were. Early music is a very different story, as the direct connection with the roots is gone. We can guess but never know." **Octavie Dostaler-Lalonde** adds that having a direct line to the past does not always reveal the complete picture: "We tend to make a lot of assumptions based on post-war aesthetics. But 19th-century aesthetics were fundamentally

different. A recording can give us an idea of how music was played, but should be seen in the context of its time". Staier is not convinced that the approach of repertoires should vary according to their time-stamp: "Brahms and Schönberg are as dead as Bach. Is there a big difference between music from composers you can call, or from those long gone? You could turn this around: taking notation as a point of departure, misunderstandings can occur as easily in contemporary as in centuries-old music".

The concluding exchange comes from **George Ross** and Staier, tackling the pragmatic issue of what kind of instrument to choose for a concert featuring early as well as less-early music. "If you start with Haydn and end with Brahms - or vice versa - you use just one instrument and opt for one that fits the later repertoire. I do it too", Staier says. "This is not an aesthetic statement, though, but a commitment to quality of performance".

Jasmina Črnčič

PANEL

AUDIENCE DEVELOPMENT: EXPERT ROOMS

FEDERICO RINALDI Audience engagement projects co-ordinator, BOZAR
STÉPHANIE WINTZERITH Audience surveys specialist
CONSTANZE WIMMER Professor for Audience Engagement,
Vice-Rector for Academic and International Affairs University of Music and Performing Arts Graz
ANDREW MCINTYRE Morris Hargreaves McIntyre

There are three separate but related issues for musicians and venues. The first is luring live audiences back after a year of disrupted and cancelled concerts. The second is engaging the audiences that are already known with new initiatives, and the third is attracting audiences who have not been reached before.

Returning audiences will be divided between those anxious to get back to their concert going as soon as it is allowed and those who are anxious about attending until they are sure it is safe to do so. Peer example may be important: with people seeing well-attended events in their neighbourhood and deciding that they do not want to miss out. The confidence due to vaccination is likely to speed up the process of 'audience recovery'.

OBSERVATIONS

• The virus year has not only lost audiences, more positively it has found new ones as musicians have reached out online and found means to give smaller, shorter and more intimate performances. The template has shifted from performances in concert halls and churches to domestic settings, either in person or via the internet. It will be important not to lose these new recruits when things return to normal.

• In terms of reinforcing audience engagement in concert there is a balance to be struck between introducing novel arrangements and not alienating the concert goers who are most comfortable with traditional and predictable formats. The placing of the musicians, perhaps at the centre of the audience rather than in front; movement and changes of positioning, costumes and clever lighting can all liven up the experience.

• Audience development – attracting a new and different crowd – requires different kinds of initiatives,

typically involving reaching out into new communities, even by taking performances in by taxi. Involving children so that they bring their parents and parents' friends is a well tried but never exhausted technique. Participation projects and placing musicians into community residencies can pay big dividends.

• Venues need to reach audiences that reflect the diversity of the cities they serve, not just the usual suspects; this is likely to involve a mixture of differentiated marketing and carefully designed events that target first time audiences and lure them into more frequent attendance.

• Audience types divide into segments, from the knowledgeable and committed who know precisely what they want and can glean it from a minimum of detailed information about the music and performers, to those who need to be sold a story and those who have negative perceptions of concert need extra stimulus to overcome their resistance to attending.

• The promoter can use targeted marketing for each segment, either cajoling them to come to the same event, or by packaging events in clusters. There can also be fringe and supplementary events bolted on to the main concert series to motivate particular sectors. None of this is new but it will be emphasised as the battle for audience regeneration intensifies. For EM musicians greater flexibility in concert styles and formats is a huge opportunity because they have less reliance on the 'overture – concerto – symphony' format of mainstream orchestras.

Sofie Taes

FAILURES NIGHT

A FEAST OF FAILURES

JOCHEN SANDIG Ludwigsburger Schlossfestspiele
MICHAEL MAUL Bachfest Leipzig
SARAH WEDL-WILSON Hans Eisler Musikhochschule Berlin
STEVEN WALTER PODIUM Esslingen, Beethovenfest Bonn

Saturday night at a festive REMA summit: time for cocktails and fails. Quite a few partygoers have gathered for a roundtable session that operates on the notion that sharing equals caring. Therapeutic for the speakers, a how-not-to guide for participants: stories of projects past and opportunities missed could sow the seeds of success!

Cellist-turned-concert promotor **Steven Walter**, tonight's master of ceremony, discloses his love of early music yet promises an evening of stories beyond that realm. The aim: to de-stigmatize failure. "We are so used to presenting glorious achievements that the discourse of disaster tends to stay under the radar. Perhaps we're not appreciating that talking about failure creates space to investigate what went wrong, what consistently goes wrong, and what that teaches us. The number of lessons learnt in a year: why wouldn't that be a valid quantifier for success? On the other hand, we don't want to glorify failure: it sucks to fail, particularly on stage. But accepting the premise of a potential fiasco going into a project is important: how else can we aim at being original? Safety and innovation don't go together. To quote Camus: 'Always go too far, or you'll never find truth'. This could be our mantra. I'd say: fail with enthusiasm and you'll endure it more easily. Just try not to cause too much damage." Finally, Walter makes a case for the euphoria of ignorance: "Trying not to know everything can release a lot of energy."

And with that, the focus shifts to first-hand experiences of epic fails. Walter takes the lead with a story entitled *You need a ritual*. "We talk a lot about experimental concepts, with a view to making performance more immersive, sensual and unique. The idea is great and certainly helped in building my career. But I've also experienced failure, mostly connected to the uneasiness caused by broken rituals. When you meddle with the seamless experience that a traditional concert is, but don't inform participants about what's expected instead, you create an unsettling situation. Music needs a safe space. Avoid people overthinking things as it makes them self-conscious. It's about striking the right note between openness and chaos".

Walter's second tale, *Content, not technology*, looks back upon a project aiming at the creation of an app for curating classical music, in order to

address the problem of listening without context. “It allowed for a single piece to be enhanced with all kinds of content. But it didn’t work long-term, simply because we’re not technology people. Building something from scratch with good interoperability and functionality is extremely difficult. Perfection is for silicon valley, not for a cultural organization with small resources. We decided to henceforth focus on content, because that’s where our strength is”.

Sarah Wedl-Wilson, rector of the Hans Eisler Musikhochschule in Berlin, is eager to have the sharing over with: “After 29 years this is still embarrassing”. Wedl-Wilson goes back to the period following her graduation from Cambridge university, when she got a job working for an orchestra that was to travel from St. Petersburg to Salzburg. Luggage and instruments were supposed to arrive ahead of the group, following a schedule that was extensively discussed with the (experienced) transport company. But a change in the Salzburg rehearsal planning hadn’t made its way to the document, resulting in a road chase to retrieve the driver, a halved rehearsal and a lesson for life: “Make sure that everything is watertight. Information is like hot cake: off with it to whomever it might concern as soon as it comes in.”

Festival intendant **Michael Maul** adds to the discussion with a story from his days as “a dusty musicologist”. As a sniffing dog for the Bach-Archiv Leipzig, he was sent on a quest for documentation on Bach’s life. When the Berlin Wall came down, he headed to East Germany. Four years, thousands of kilometers and a stack of steep gas bills later, the search still hadn’t yielded any results. Maul changed tactics: “I convinced my bosses that information about other baroque composers could be of interest as well and instantly life became easier for me. I found documents in connection with Scheidt and Schütz, and ended up discovering a Bach *aria*: the first big discovery in 80 years, causing quite a sensation. A fair gift in return for my endurance, I think”.

As an intendant, Maul continued to be brave and prone to experimenting. A ring of cantatas in collaboration with John Eliot Gardiner turned from risky to ravishing. Lesson learnt: “I’m a big Bach fan and apparently there are others!” A more recent memory: “In 2020 we wanted to evoke the spirit of the Bach family and their yearly gatherings. Bach choirs from around the world were ready to join us in Leipzig… and then covid happened.” A tsunami of issues with refunding ensued, leaving the intendant heartbroken: “We cancelled the festival but still gathered online. That was important to heal myself.”

Ludwigsburger Schlossfestspiele intendant **Jochen Sandig** gets the final say: “My biggest failure goes far beyond the realm of programming. We have to return to the early days of my career, right after the Wall came down. I had the opportunity to sign a contract allowing the Kunsthaus Tacheles to use a building in the center of Berlin for the next 30 years. I was sitting in the Rotes Rathaus, pen-in-hand, when the deal got cancelled because of possible restitutions.
The dream collapsed into a nightmare. Never again I experienced such a sense of loss. Yet in the end it passed. The shock gave way to an important insight: always look beyond what’s right ahead, and have an escape plan ready in case disaster strikes”.

Sofie Taes

EARLY MUSIC SUMMIT

ONLINE

SUNDAY

EARLY MUSIC CONCERT

22 NOVEMBER

BREAKFAST SESSION

MEDIA BREAKFAST

MARIE HÉDIN La Lettre du Musicien
MATTHIEU BENOIT Outhere France
SÉVERINE GARNIER Classique mais pas has been
CARLO FLORE critic

The media environment has changed dramatically over the last decade. The old dominance of daily newspapers and specialist print magazines has been replaced by a panoply of online sites, some related to old publications, others invented for the online age. At the start of this century coverage for a concert was a matter of contacting the critics and arts editors of a few local press outlets and radio stations. Getting feature coverage and reviews for records could be safely left to the press departments of the record labels and the reviews would duly appear in the weekend papers or magazines like Diapason and Gramophone. They still do but there are many other global outlets too, as well the self-publication opportunities of YouTube and social media.

Navigating through this is not easy for ensembles without permanent media representation. Music journalists and reviewers need to understand the new environment, when they find paid work harder to get. Articles have become shorter, publications operating on new business models and online sites being reluctant to offer fees that reflect the work time involved. This session looked at the media from several viewpoints; those of the online sites, the publicity agents and the critics.

OBSERVATIONS

• New formats have required new business models, including the linkage of articles to advertising. While this was often the reality with print magazines it is now more openly admitted by online sites, though they may maintain an independent editorial line.

• Musicians need to decide what sort of critics they want. There are specialist academics, general music critics who are professional, and social listener critics who give an unpaid review: bloggers of various sorts. A good critic will want not just information about the performer but a conversation about the history of the music and the context of a release, together with consistency in the information.

• The Classical Music press is not a huge ecosystem and the Early Music section of it even smaller so its journalists are approachable. Some critics are happy to engage directly with musicians (but the musicians must accept that not every review will be a good one), some like to remain aloof and only deal with their editors, some like the halfway of being approached through a press agent.

• There are no rules for publications. Some will have strict ethics, others will be happy to follow whatever the market will tolerate. In this way the music press is no different from the general media circus. Some will want sober reflection and impeccable credentials, others will only be interested in sensation.

• From the press and publicity agent's point of view it helps if the musician or the repertoire has something that stands out as special. The musician has to ask what is it that makes a project interesting in a crowded market? Person gives nice concert is not enough.

• There are some elements to the press-musician relationship that need to be thought about. Be nice and as helpful as possible. Do not be upset if an article is shorter than hoped for (journalists are usually given word or character lengths that they have to stick to). Make sure the journalist or critic has all the information needed to write an interesting piece (after all, they have to persuade the reader). Understand the target audience of the media outlet, whether website, radio programme, magazine or podcast.

Simon Mundy

BREAKFAST SESSION

INSTRUMENT MAKERS BREAKFAST

During the next two years REMA plans to open up to the entire Early Music Sector and so this panel was organised in order to discuss what might be the interest of the instrument-makers' community to join REMA. As is known, networking organisations for instrument makers already exist, they are, however, organised either on smaller, local levels or are instrument-specific. The question posed to the group was therefore rather straight-forward: how could you both as individuals and as a community benefit from joining REMA? / What can REMA do for you?

• REMA as a **lobbying organisation** on an international level, working as a connecting link between instrument makers and musicians, **organising events when the two communities could meet**, where the participants also wouldn't have to limit themselves to the instrument they primarily play/build — learn from each other. A form of interdisciplinary networking.

• REMA could provide **an open source database of instrument measurements, iconographic representations, academic papers and other types of publications related to instrument building and organology as well as a list of approved wood suppliers.**

• For early instrument makers there is no official schooling system put in place so REMA could aid in **providing a platform for professional inter-workshop knowledge exchange**. There seems to be a preoccupation with how the knowledge could get transmitted — many makers cannot afford to hire apprentices in their workshops so the fear is present that the knowledge which was gathered during a long period of time will ultimately get lost once the workshop closes. There is also the hazard of out of date mechanical tools that are largely being used in smaller workshops and which often don't have the necessary security clearance. This makes it legally challenging for makers to hire apprentices since they do not wish to be responsible for possible injuries.

• REMA could assist the process of **merging of the practical and academic fields**

• *Question for REMA*: What kind of gatherings can we expect that would be suited for this particular community?

• REMA could **connect instrument makers and museums** which often have very strict protocols when it comes to obtaining drawings/measures/examining instruments. It is often difficult for makers to access smaller, "off-radar" museums which potentially hold valuable information

• REMA could **enlarge the network**, "scouting" individuals who usually don't participate in events similar to the Early Music Summit and are not members of the known instrument making communities.

• REMA membership could guarantee that makers get a **more direct access** to instrument drawings, iconography examples, historical instrument specimens, etc., in order to **shorten the communication time between individuals and museum representatives** and to facilitate the inspection processes on actual historical instruments.

Final remarks revolved around a positive outlook to continue the conversation with the understanding that such a collaboration could potentially be very fruitful if the engagement from the side of the early instrument-making community remains active.

Jasmina Črnčič

BREAKFAST SESSION

TRANSITION IN EARLY MUSIC

KATHRIN DEVENTER European Festivals Association (EFA).
STEF CONINX Kunstenpunt
JORIS JANSSENS Idea

After 2 days of stock taking, the summit sets sail for the future with a breakfast session featuring a panel of professional networkers. On the menu: a discussion about the societal role of the arts and strategies to make the creative sector more inclusive and sustainable.

Stef Coninx, moderator, calls in from the Kunstenpunt office in Brussels, located next to BOZAR - the intended host of this meeting. Juxtaposing the increasingly international and inclusive character of the early music field - exemplified by the 360° approach now fostered by REMA - with the growing issue of mobility, Coninx addresses the acceleration of change spurred by the pandemic. The early music sector also finds itself affected by other crises, such as ecology, financial stress, the refugee stream and political matters, while demands regarding hypermobility, competition and flexibility seem to be on the rise. Do we sit down and wait? Or ignite a process of change? Is thinking about change the best way to address the issues, or should we focus on transition?

Policy advisor **Joris Janssens** sheds light on the latter by means of a study he's currently carrying out for IETM (international network for contemporary performing arts). For about a year, Janssens has been involved in rewiring the IETM via a co-creative transition exercise. "The first step was to engage the 500 members in looking back upon the past 40 years, during which the network turned from a directors-and-venues-only initiative to a group representing the entire ecosystem of the contemporary performing arts. Back in 1981 a lot of alternative festivals and venues found themselves mismatched with existing network organizations that were targeting larger players. Adding to the need for an alternative expertise hub was the challenge of sharing information and exchanging knowledge in a pre-digital working space. From the beginning, IETM focused on pulling resources and increasing capacity for emerging artists, supporting sustainable careers, advocacy and mobility issues, and the development of an ecosystem firmly rooted in society.

Early efforts were quite successful: the network grew, spinoffs emerged, and eventually a 360° approach was adopted. But IETM had to withstand a fair share of crises too, and as the aims of the founders came under pressure, the urgency for an investigation of its complex and interconnected problems was felt. The transition

exercise that followed borrowed ideas from transition thinking in other sectors, including two basic insights: 1) transition is a movement from A to B, from an unsustainable to a sustainable situation; 2) unsustainable practices do exist, but experiments towards a sustainable future do too: there is hope and a real potential for improvement. Combined, these insights reflect the transition process's bifold movement: a breakdown period in which unsustainable habits are phased out, and a reconstruction stage in which new sustainable practices are developed and turned mainstream.

The design of these two movements in connection with IETM kicked off with a survey and several online brainstorms in which post-its listing current issues were gathered on a virtual whiteboard. These were subsequently grouped into five domains of pressure (social, human, artistic, ecological, economic) to which 20 building blocks for sustainable practices were allocated. The blocks and a set of guiding values (mindsets such as generosity, passion, drive, ...) went on to form the foundation of the new ecosystem.

As a next step, the team got to work on establishing the actors in the transitory process. First, in order to start to break down persistent habits, someone needs to create an urgency. Then, there's experiments to be ran, connected and fleshed out to eventually be turned mainstream. Breaking down existing and developing new practices can't happen without a clear direction, so somebody needs to set a goal. These roles were mapped in a subsequent exercise, which demonstrated that an organization can walk part of the road on its own, but will need help to cross some bridges. In this respect, networks are important as is assistance from the outside: the education sector, the communities in which an organization is rooted, policy makers, funding mechanisms etc. This is where we are now with IETM: we have our building blocks, mapped the roles and designed a curve for mainstreaming the transition. We're at the point where the two movements cross, which is a tricky one: old habits are broken down but there is no new common approach yet. A potential chaotic situation that is nonetheless an unavoidable part of the process."

EFA's **Kathrin Deventer** is impressed by the work of Joris' team and by the generosity of IETM to share the experience with other networks. But thinking about transition, she finds herself wondering about the nature of the arts and the role of the artist. "Is it even possible to make this exercise in the realm of the arts? Because transition is purpose-driven: it starts from a necessity and strives for optimization. Can we just assume that a need for such a trajectory exists in our field? And how continuous is that line leading to the future? What if unforeseen developments break up the transition? My feeling is that the notion of art has nothing to do with a continuous line from A to B. Furthermore, I see the artist as an important actor in a process of change, not just as a 'reactor'. Finally, artists are more than a dot drawn in an academic exercise. They stand at the core of an artistic process that is free, autonomous and soul-driven. So I wonder how a transition exercise would work with all the aspects that we cannot translate into metrics".

A much-debated element in ongoing transitory processes is the new reality shaped by the covid 19-crisis. "There is no more escape: we must change", says Stef Coninx. Joris Janssens: "Corona has certainly added to the pressure. Let's hope that reflection doesn't only focus on short-term changes in the system. We are learning a lot that can be useful in the long run, for instance by networking digitally instead of physically, and thereby making discussions more inclusive".

Kathrin Deventer, too, sees these extraordinary times as a lever towards change: "The way in which we deal with crises can yield new opportunities. The pandemic legitimizes our questions more than ever and we should indeed use this time and space to reflect about the challenges we face. But I wouldn't like to see discourse taking the reign

over action. Let's not forget the essence of what we, networks and stakeholders of the arts, have to do. If we consider ourselves relevant, then let's find a platform to work for artists and audiences, let's reach out and connect with society. The reflective element is important, but we cannot become moralists or amateurs: we are professionals with a task to fulfill. A final note: don't underestimate the work the sector has done this year. The survival exercise has cost an enormous amount of effort and energy. Many organizations have succumbed, many artists have sold their instruments. And the hard times are not behind us yet. I fear that many festival organizers will face a burnout in the years to come because the struggle for life was so intense. We need money and time to understand what happened and think about what lies ahead".

How could politicians and governmental bodies support the arts sector in that respect? Joris Janssens: "As soon as the sector has taken these fundamental discussions to the next level, there will be choices to be made by the policy makers. They'll have to balance the five domains. Economy used to rule all, but a retargeted approach could take us elsewhere: lobbies are powerful, but so are stories. This makes it all the more important to have a story when engaging with policy makers. And that is where transition thinking can help. Why is what you do important? And how did that come to be under pressure? How are those stressors connected to issues at play in other societal domains?".

Kathrin Deventer: "Preparation is key, indeed. We have to look carefully at who is around the table, organize ourselves in our networks, be at the right place at the right time and make sure that our voice is heard. Now I would question: do we have enough time, enough maturity as a network to do that? Because this is a continuous construction exercise, not a simple case of advocacy. Finally, I still wonder if we're not overstressing the economic merits of the arts, instead of the real value proposition that is the autonomy of artistic creation."

"This is not about instrumentalizing the arts," Joris Janssens agrees. "Artistic autonomy is part of the value framework that we take along to the future. Artists are critical: holding up a mirror, they question unsustainable practices and drive societal discussions. They are incremental in the transition process too, as imagination and creativity are indispensable when it comes to getting people on board. I strongly believe that artists can contribute to the process from their very core: their artistic identity and creative practices".

Sofie Taes

PANEL

DIGITAL EXPERIENCES OF MUSIC

MIKAYLA JENSEN-LARGE McGill University, Schola Cantorum Basiliensis
LUKE O'SHAUGHNESSY Opera Europa
EDWIN HUIZINGA SweetWater Classical Music Festival, Carmel Bach Festival Baroque & Classical Academy, Acronym Ensemble
JOHN ZION OurConcerts.Live

The panel opened with a question addressed at **Edwin Huizinga** to describe the different experiences of organising live music (live and online). His energy is mainly being focused into the feeling of community — especially in these difficult times of the pandemic he finds that the connecting factor is the most important one. Instead of canceling, Huizinga moved many of his events outside even if they were played on gut strings. His key to a successful online event lies in the involvement of the audience: his online events are always organised with a follow-up question and answer session where artists and audience members can connect. When considering the monetisation of online events his answer was to redefine the value of time, stating that the latter is of the upmost importance, not just for the performer but for the audience as well. Asking even for a small fee in such light might therefore bring more sense into why someone would/ should pay for an online event. This might also be a good point to convince audiences to pay for online events in the first place instead of opting for pre-recorded versions which are already available.

Luke O'Shaughnessy represents the Opera Europa Network and specifically the European-funded Opera Vision project, an online platform for live and recorded streaming of opera performances, collaborating with more than 200 opera houses, festivals and independent producers. The content is available free of charge. By now they are streaming almost once a week. Expanding the reach and the educational side are very important: during the pandemic their views have spiked from around 200.000 views/month before the pandemic to more than a million views/month at the time of the EEMS. Their main publishing platform is YouTube since they hope to reach as many different types of audiences as is possible and they succeeded to establish a global reach.

John Zion founded OurConcerts.live in April 2020. Currently they are producing and streaming between 20 and 40 events each month. Most

of their content is behind a paywall, they offer different types of tickets, packages, subscriptions. Their goal is to enable artists and organisations to keep performing by providing them a venue and the necessary technology to see the project through. They took a lot of inspiration from outside of the strict musical field, examining popular online video games as well as looking at how some of the major sports leagues in the US handled the pandemic. Similarly to Huizinga, Zion too believes reaching the audience directly is important in the times when we cannot physically visit concerts.

Due to the pandemic the overall response time has shortened drastically. Both artists as well as managers and presenters had to become extremely adaptable. In this, Zion finds a good opportunity for sustainability of online activity since high quality content is in fact much more accessible than what most artists believe.
Zion further mentioned the possibility of co-producing live online events where the involved organisations bring in their own audiences, offer additional content such as live-moderation, post-concert discussion, etc.

When asked about advice on what smaller organisations can do, Zion advised the so-called "bootstrap approach" where the buy-in on technical equipment is actually rather low.
Opera Vision doesn't use specific tools for public profiling, their main aim is to reach as diverse of an audience as possible and based on their views they estimate they are being successful.
Huizinga also mentioned the option of establishing a volunteer base to assist the production of live-stream events.
When asked about the difference in audio production in a live-stream vs. a traditional recording, Zion replied that it heavily depends on what kind of resources one has available. When comparing live-stream and in-person concerts one of the things he finds are similar is the spontaneity feeling one gets when participating in either live or online events, both as an audience member as well as the performing artist. He advises against comparing live-stream audio quality to that of traditional CD recordings. He advocates for live-stream performances over pre-recorded material, claiming that the way the artists show up in a live-stream environment is fundamentally different to a pre-recorded concert, it is more tangible and thus more satisfying.

Since the singers in opera rarely stand still on stage, O'Shaughnessy and Opera Vision encourage the collaborating opera houses to use VHS Radio microphones whenever possible to ensure a better sound experience. Huizinga often uses DPA microphones or wireless packs.

Jasmina Črnčič

PANEL

THE CONCERT OF THE FUTURE

SARA MOHR-PIETSCH Dartington Arts
MANON VIAU Collectif ARVIVA
TAMAR BRÜGGEMAN Wonderfeel Festival
DANIEL TARRIDA Bachcelona
MARIANNE VERSTEEGH Kunsten '92

OBSERVATIONS

• Ensembles and promoters have been forced to think of new formats and communication tools this year and so it is a good moment to consider how concert life might look in the years to come. It was acknowledged that the traditions of concert giving have not changed much in the last sixty years, though the types of venue have widened and festivals have stretched the boundaries more than seasonal programme series. There is no reason why any aspect of performance presentation should go unquestioned, from what a ticket includes to the length of events, the staging and the use of multimedia.

• The example was given of the Wonderfeel Festival in northern Netherlands, which is an outdoor amplified festival, effectively applying the working methods of small rock and folk festivals to the classical music field. It does not announce its programme or performers long in advance. Tickets are sold for entry to the festival grounds, not the individual events and the audience is free to wander from stage to stage 'snacking' on the performances. This was seen as a lifestyle festival rather than a template for others but the fact that it throws out almost all the assumptions about normal concert practice without significance either from musicians or audience was seen as worth noting.

• Concerts themselves can be part of a lifestyle choice, involving sustainable travel, influence on catering, sharing of resources etc. It means that performers are likely to set conditions on how and where they give concerts to fit in with their philosophies, especially around climate change and consumption.

• The right venue for each project is vital and musicians should be involved in planning the setting, especially as so much early music relies on finding an appropriate context.

• How much new thinking will find its way into mainstream concert hall programming, as opposed to festivals, may well depend not only on audience tastes but on the expectations of government and city funders. The major concert institutions are often constrained by plans set out in advance in order to secure official subsidies. Such agreements can have a great

effect on reforms, for and against. Conditions of social relevance, diversity, audience expansion, education work and co-operation within the arts sector can all move concert giving forward while insistence on business modelling, financial targets and inflexible planning can hold back change.

• The future of governmental support for music in general is uncertain, with worries beginning to surface that cuts in arts spending may follow the virus as public budgets shrink.

Simon Mundy